RESOLUTION 2021-004 1 2 A RESOLUTION AGAINST THE USE OF THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY'S COMMUNITY 3 ENROLLMENT QUESTION IN ALL PARTS OF THE STUDENT APPLICATION PROCESS Authors: Story Edison.22, Delegate, Sociology; Benjamin McKinley.255 5 Sponsor: Executive Committee 6 WHEREAS the Council of Graduate Students (CGS) is the representative body of all graduate students enrolled at The Ohio State University as established by Article II.I of the CGS Constitution; and 9 10 WHEREAS the Council is vested with the authority to voice graduate student concerns and needs to the university; and 12 WHEREAS the Ohio State University currently requires all accepted students to respond to the Community Enrollment 13 Question post-admission¹;and 14 15 WHEREAS the Community Enrollment Question requires students to disclose prior felony charges, in addition to prior or 16 pending academic and behavioral misconduct charges; and 17 18 WHEREAS answering "yes" to the Community Enrollment Question puts any potential student's admission on hold until 19 they provide a detailed explanation of the situation pertaining to their felony conviction and this statement is reviewed by 20 the Community Enrollment Review Committee²; and 21 22 WHEREAS the University Community Enrollment Review Committee has the discretion to prevent the student from 23 attending The Ohio State University if they disclose a felony conviction when responding to the community enrollment 24 question²; and 25 26 WHEREAS as part of the subsequent investigation into applicants who answered "yes" to the Community Enrollment Question at The Ohio State University, potential students are subjected to a background check that shows the committee 28 not only their felony status but also other information such as misdemeanor charges and arrest history, all of which may 29 be weighed in the consideration of barring the applicant from admittance²; and 30 31 WHEREAS the wording of associated background information regarding the Community Enrollment Question is 32 ambiguous and does not make clear to applicants that misdemeanors, previous arrests, and other factors from background 33 checks will be considered in the decision-making process; and 34 35 WHEREAS the ambiguity about whether applicants need to disclose misdemeanor charges and whether these charges will 36 be considered in the review process has led applicants to not disclose misdemeanors and other supplementary information pertaining to their criminal history to the review board³; and 121e Students 38 39 WHEREAS a report on the use of criminal histories in college admission decisions found a "broad array of convictions 40 are viewed as negative factors in the context of admissions decision-making, including drug and alcohol convictions,

43

42 criminal record, there is an increased likelihood that the application will be rejected", and

misdemeanor convictions, and youthful offender adjudications. If it is discovered that an applicant has failed to disclose a

¹The Ohio State University. (n.d) University Community Enrollment Review Committee Review Process http://enrollmentservices.osu.edu/community-enrollment-review/

² The Ohio State University. (2017). Self-Disclosure of Criminal Convictions, 4.17. https://hr.osu.edu/wp-content/uploads/policy417.pdf

³ Bryant, Angela (personal communication, August 18, 2020) worked closely with multiple students who were denied admittance to OSU due to their failure to fully disclose their entire criminal history as a result of this ambiguity.

⁴ Weissman, M., Rosenthal, A., Warth, P., Wolf, E., & Messina-Yauchzy, M. (2010). The Use of Criminal History Records in College Admissions Reconsidered. Center for Community Alternatives http://www.communityalternatives.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/02/use-of-criminal-history-records-reconsidered.pdf

44 WHEREAS beyond the initial issue of potential bias introduced by the ambiguity of the Community Enrollment Question, 45 studies have revealed the amount of additional time and effort required to complete criminal history questions on college 46 applications results in a higher attrition rate of students completing their application to a university^{5,6}; and

47

48 WHEREAS The Ohio State University admission data demonstrates burnout for applicants who respond "yes" to the 49 Community Enrollment Question is present in the application process. In 2018, 24% of students who reported a felony on 50 the community enrollment question withdrew from the application process⁷; and

51

52 WHEREAS a recent audit study found students who reported a felony offense during their college applications are approximately three times as likely to be rejected for final admission⁵; and 53

54

55 WHEREAS in 2018, 41% of students who went before the University Community Enrollment Committee did not complete their enrollment at The Ohio State University⁷; and

57

58 WHEREAS taken together, these studies reveal the notable barrier the Community Enrollment Question serves for students applying to The Ohio State University and demonstrates that the question perpetuates discrimination against 60 those with a criminal history in academic institutions; and

61

62 WHEREAS an array of articles find black students are disproportionately rejected relative to their white counterparts due 63 to the fact that they report felony convictions more frequently⁵; and

64

65 WHEREAS black men are 6 times more likely to be incarcerated in 2017 for a felony conviction than white men. Though 66 less severe, black women are also notably charged, tried, convicted, and incarcerated at a higher rate (2x) than white 67 women. This disparity is particularly salient for potential black students, as black men between the ages 18-19 were 12 68 times more likely to be incarcerated than white men their same age and black women between the ages of 18-19 were 4.4 times as likely to be incarcerated than white women⁸; and

70

71 WHEREAS this literature demonstrates that including sections in college applications such as the Community Enrollment Question instills a heightened level of discrimination against black applicants; and

73

74 WHEREAS these studies suggest that the application process for The Ohio State University would be more equitable to applicants with criminal histories, particularly black and other minority applicants, if the Community Enrollment Question were no longer included in any part of The OSU application process; and

76 77

78 WHEREAS the argument that removing the Community Enrollment Question is unsafe due to a potential subsequent rise 79 in crime is unfounded, as universities that do not ask students to disclose their criminal history do not report a higher 80 incidence of crime than universities that do^{4,6}; and saluate Students

81

82 WHEREAS many academic institutions do not require the disclosure of criminal history as a condition for admittance^{4,6}; 83 and

84

https://www2.ed.gov/documents/beyond-the-box/fact-sheet.pdf

⁵ Stewart, Robert and Christopher Uggen. 2019. "Criminal records and college admissions: A modified experimental audit." Criminology (58): 1-33. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1111/1745-9125.12229

⁶ US Department of Education: Beyond the Box. (2016).

⁷ Bryant, Angela (personal communication, May 15,2018) Communication between Lisa Gilmore in OSU administration and Dr. Angela Bryant

Bronson, J. and Carson, A. E. (2019). Prisoners in 2017. Bureau of Justice Statistics. https://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/p17.pdf

WHEREAS multiple Big Ten universities no longer require students to disclose their criminal histories as a condition for admittance, including the University of Minnesota, the University of Wisconsin, and Rutgers University^{9,10}; and

87

88 WHEREAS some previous studies suggest removing felony conviction screeners in the employment setting results in 89 statistical discrimination, as employers have been found to favor applicants from demographics that are statistically less 90 likely to have criminal histories when it comes to interviews and employment¹¹; and

91

92 WHEREAS subsequent studies have demonstrated removing the criminal history screener from employment applications does not result in statistical bias 12,13,14; and

94

WHEREAS faculty at The Ohio State University also find the Community Enrollment Question and background checks of the OSU community to be discriminatory and request the question be removed from all aspects of student enrollment, in addition to faculty and staff hiring practices¹⁵.

98

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED the Council of Graduate Students desires the Community Enrollment Question to, at minimum, no longer require students to disclose felony convictions, behavioral misconduct, or any other form of criminal history as a stipulation of attendance.

102

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED the Community Enrollment Question may only require students to disclose prior academic misconduct.

105

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED the Community Enrollment Question should not be changed from required to optional, as this may lead students to feel obligated or pressured to disclose their criminal histories.

108

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that The Ohio State University application process should not create an additional question, required or not, pertaining to the criminal convictions of students.

111

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that The Ohio State University should not engage in statistical discrimination by admitting fewer students who are statistically more likely to have criminal histories if the Community Enrollment Question is altered to only refer to academic misconduct.

115

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED the Council of Graduate Students requires university admissions to increase transparency on the use of the Community Enrollment Question and make available admissions data from the years 2017-2020 on who applies, who is admitted, who completes their final applications, who answers "yes" to the Community Enrollment Question, and the number of applicants who attend OSU after completing the community enrollment review process. The Council further requires supplementary racial, gender, and age demographic data corresponding to these admission statistics.

120

Council of Graduate Students

https://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/ilr104&div=33&g sent=1&casa token=&collection=journals

⁹ Bryant, Angela (personal communication August 25, 2020) reports the University of Minnesota, University of Wisconsin, and Rutgers do not have the box

¹⁰ Clarey, D. (2016, December 05). University nixes felony question on student applications. *Minnesota daily*.https://www.mndaily.com/article/2016/12/felony-question-taken-off-admission-application

Agan, Amanda and Sonja Starr. 2018. "Ban the Box, Criminal Records, and Racial Discrimination: A Field Experiment." The Quarterly Journal of Economics 133(1):191–235. https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjx028

¹² Vuolo, Mike, Sarah Lageson, and Christopher Uggen. 2017. "Criminal Record Questions in the Era of 'Ban the Box': Criminal Record Questions." Criminology & Public Policy 16(1):139–65. https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1111/1745-9133.12250
¹³ Flake, D. F. (2018). Do Ban-the-Box Laws Really Work? Iowa L. Rev: (104):1079-1127.

¹⁴ Emsellem, M., & Avery, B. (2016). Racial Profiling in Hiring: A Critique of New "Ban the Box" Studies. National Employment Law Project. https://s27147.pcdn.co/wp-content/uploads/Policy-Brief-Racial-Profiling-in-Hiring-Critique-New-Ban-the-Box-Studies.pdf

¹⁵ Bryant, A. (2020). A CALL TO BAN THE BOX AT THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY. https://docs.google.com/document/d/10vrJATBs4NZN87lQsD_z1DTTxj-bUyqQd5cn_wQNcAQ/edit?usp=sharing

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that until The Ohio State University removes the felony charge and behavior misconduct portions of the Community Enrollment Question from all stages of the student application process, OSU must clearly specify to students what supplementary information will be reviewed from background checks in order to increase applicant understanding of what additional information they should provide in their response to the Community Enrollment Question.

127 BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED that the Council of Graduate Students directs its President, Vice President, and Chief of Staff to distribute this resolution to all proper leadership and authorities of The Ohio State University and its partners.

130 Approved: Yes/No

126

133

137

131 132 Date: __10/2/20____

134 135 Stephen K. Post

136 Stephen J. Post, President



Council of Graduate Students at The Ohio State University